

Tunc Medeni¹, Mukhamediyev B.M.², Mazhenov R.K.³

¹PhD, Member at Management School, Yildirim Beyazit University,
Ankara, Turkey, e-mail: tuncmedeni@gmail.com

²d.e.s., professor, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University,
Almaty, Kazakhstan, e-mail: bulat.muchamediev@kaznu.kz

³1-st year PhD student, specialization is «Public Administration», Al-Farabi Kazakh National University,
Almaty, Kazakhstan, e-mail: rinatmazhenov@gmail.com

**IMPLEMENTATION OF PROJECT MANAGEMENT
IN THE SYSTEM PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION OF KAZAKHSTAN.
RUSSIAN EXPERIENCE**

The productive application of project management in the commercial sector gave impetus to the use of project management tools and performance of public authorities. The article is devoted to the description of the process of implementing project management in the system of public administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Experience in the use of project management in governmental bodies of the country has been studied. At the same time, the process of implementing project management in the authorities of the Russian Federation was analyzed to explore the experience of the near abroad. The experience of using the project management of Kazakhstan and the Russian Federation in carrying out large national projects such as EXPO-2017 and SOCHI-2014 has been studied.

Key words: Project management, public administration, implementation of project management, project office, project management, public authority.

Тунк Медени¹, Мухамедиев Б.М.², Маженов Р.К.³

¹PhD, Йылдырым Баязид Университеті, Менеджмент Мектебінің Мүшесі,
Анкара қ., Түркия, e-mail: tuncmedeni@gmail.com

²э.ғ.д., профессор, әл-Фараби атындағы Қазақ ұлттық университеті,
Алматы қ., Қазақстан, e-mail: bulat.muchamediev@kaznu.kz

³«Мемлекеттік және жергілікті басқару» мамандығы бойынша 1-ші курс PhD докторанты,
әл-Фараби атындағы Қазақ ұлттық университеті, Алматы қ., Қазақстан, e-mail: rinatmazhenov@gmail.com

**Жобалық менеджментті Қазақстан Республикасы басқару жүйесіне енгізу.
Ресей тәжірибесі**

Коммерциялық сектордағы жобаларды басқарудың тиімді қолданылуы жобаларды басқару құралдарын және мемлекеттік органдардың қызметінде пайдалануды ынталандырды. Мақала Қазақстан Республикасында мемлекеттік басқару жүйесіндегі жобаларды басқаруды жүзеге асыру процесінің сипаттамасына арналған. Елдің мемлекеттік органдарында жобаны басқару тәжірибесін зерделенді. Сонымен қатар жақын шет елдердің тәжірибесін зерделеу мақсатында Ресей Федерациясының билік органдарында жобаларды басқаруды жүзеге асыру процесі талданды. EXPO-2017 және SOCHI-2014 сияқты ірі ұлттық жобаларды жүзеге асыруда Қазақстан мен Ресей Федерациясының жобаларды басқару тәжірибесін зерттеу тәжірибесі зерттелді.

Түйін сөздер: жобаны басқару, мемлекеттік басқару, жобаны басқаруды жүзеге асыру, жобалық офис, жобаларды басқару, мемлекеттік орган.

Тунк Медени¹, Мухамедиев Б.М.², Маженов Р.К.³

¹PhD, Член Школы Менеджмента Университета Йылдырым Баязид,
г. Анкара, Турция, e-mail: tuncmedeni@gmail

²Д.э.н., профессор, Казахский национальный университет им. аль-Фараби,
г. Алматы, Казахстан, e-mail: bulat.muchamediev@kaznu.kz

³докторант 1-го курса специальности «Государственное и местное управление»,
Казахский национальный университет им. аль-Фараби,
г. Алматы, Казахстан, e-mail: rinatmazhenov@gmail.com

Внедрение проектного менеджмента в систему государственного управления Казахстана. Российский опыт

Продуктивное использование проектного менеджмента в коммерческом секторе дало толчок для применения инструментария проектного управления и в деятельности органов государственной власти. Статья посвящена описанию процесса внедрения проектного менеджмента в систему государственного управления в Республике Казахстан. Изучен опыт применения проектного управления в государственных органах страны. Вместе с тем, в целях изучения опыта ближнего зарубежья проанализирован процесс внедрения проектного управления в органах власти Российской Федерации. Изучен опыт использования проектного управления Казахстана и Российской Федерации при проведении больших национальных проектов как ЭКСПО-2017 и СОЧИ-2014.

Ключевые слова: проектное управление, государственное управление, внедрение проектного управления, проектный офис, проектный менеджмент, государственный орган.

Currently, the issues of the use of project management which has become popular for companies are widely discussed in the field of public administration. Introduction of the tools of project management into the public administration system is not just the demands of today, but are also about numerous tasks that require detailed study.

Understanding and comprehension of the need for the use of project management in the public administration system is discussed at a high level in government bodies. However, some Kazakh experts in project management believe that this issue is being fetishized. In this connection, the process of wide application of project management tools in this area should be thoroughly studied and only then it should be introduced as a pilot project for approbation.

This process can be compared with the Gartner cycle of technology maturity, in accordance to which, in our country, state bodies passed through the first technological trigger and are now widely discussing the introduction of project management. Project management begins to turn into a certain trend. However, next period is about come, when expectations will pass and a stage of getting rid of illusions will come. In connection with this, when considering the use of project management in a particular government body, it is necessary to study the need for the introduction and availability of appropriate tools and human resources to support the work of project offices.

The purpose of this scientific article is to study the process of implementing project management in

the system of public administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The object of the study is the state bodies of the country, which began the process of using the tools of project management.

At the same time, the article focuses on the already begun process of implementing project management in the sphere of public administration of the Russian Federation. This interest is due to the fact that Kazakhstan and Russia, due to certain historical aspects, have a similar institutional environment.

Studying and analyzing the experience of implementing project management in a neighboring state will allow Kazakhstan to borrow it for use in its own public administration system. This will help to avoid many problems in promoting project management in the country, or quickly find ways to solve them. In the future, it is planned to study the experience of implementing project management in the activities of government agencies in foreign countries.

Since the process of implementing project management tools in the system of public administration in Kazakhstan is only in the initial way, the number of sources for analysis is very limited. In general, these are scientific publications on the research of certain aspects of this topic.

The use of the project approach by the authorities helps to improve the efficiency of resource management – financial, time and personnel. In the conditions of constant search for a compromise between the allocation of funds for solving one

problem of one direction and another task of another direction. (Yakimova 2015)

In addition to the process approach, project management is actively used in the sphere of state activity in many countries of the world. Offices for the management of large state projects operate in the UK, Canada, France and China. (Alibekova 2010) In many countries work is under way to study the experience of these states.

In the UK, in particular, for the management and monitoring of public projects in 2012, a separate Major Projects Authority (MPA) has been established and operating successfully. In Malaysia a specially created project office (Project Management and Delivery Unit – Pemandu) is engaged in the implementation of project management in the public administration system.

The issues of development of project management in Kazakhstan have been raised at the level of central executive agencies since 2010. So, within the framework of SE FIIR, at an enlarged meeting of the Coordinating Council, a draft Concept for the development of project management was considered. According to the head of the department, it is necessary «... to create such a system for managing state programs and projects, when a specific official responsible for the results of the project will be identified for each program, each project and each activity for their implementation, a clear calendar of events and a matrix of responsibility. When you need to answer it will be necessary not only for the timely disbursed funds and the number of meetings held, but for a specific output of the project for production capacity. « (Yereshev 2015)

President of the Republic of Kazakhstan Nazarbayev in the Address to the people of Kazakhstan on December 14, 2012 drew attention to the fact that with the improvement of management resources, it is necessary to introduce modern institutions of management and principles of corporate governance in the public sector. This directly relates to project management.

The Center for Public-Private Partnership is currently engaged in issues of implementing project management in the public administration system. This center organized the First International Congress of Project Managers. Currently, there is an active analytical work on the study of this issue, not only at the level of central authorities, but also with a broad explanation of this issue through popular media and online publications.

One of the initiators of the project management implementation in the sphere of public service is the Academy of Public Administration under the

President of the Republic of Kazakhstan. On the basis of the Academy, the Project Management Center was established. The Center's activities include developing recommendations for the implementation of the project approach in the public service system. The activity of this center is aimed at the development of appropriate training programs and their implementation in the practice of training civil servants, as well as the task of creating a pool of experts who will be able to monitor projects and advise program administrators, which will have a multiplier effect. (Abdrasilov 2015)

Competent experts in the study of world experience in the implementation of project management in the public service currently have a Regional Hub in the public service, located in the city of Astana.

In Kazakhstan, the topic of introducing project management into the activities of public authorities has become quite relevant and has already been voiced by Prime Minister B. Sagintayev, but the pace, speed and scale of this process are not high. One of the pioneers among state bodies was the General Prosecutor's Office of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Project offices were also established in the Ministry of Tourism and Sport, the Ministry of Defense and Aerospace Industry, the Astana government, government of Kyzylorda region.

But, despite apparent progress, among civil servants there is still no understanding of the expediency of this process: it is not advisable to implement project management in general, and expediency for each of them. The question that interests everyone: what will this innovation give to me? After all, working with the old scheme is more familiar, and the new one is dangerous. Hence – resistance. (Isabaeva 2017: 3)

If in Kazakhstan the issues of application of project management in the civil service system are at the initial stage of development, in Russia this direction is occupied by central departments, analytical centers and regional power institutions.

Thus, the Ministry of Economic Development of Russia is one of the main central government departments for the introduction of project management in the public service system. In 2013, the department developed a provision on the Council for the introduction of project management in federal executive bodies and state authorities of the subjects of the Russian Federation. This Council carried out work on involving experts in the field of project management in this activity.

President of the Russian Federation Vladimir Putin in his speech at the St. Petersburg International

Economic Forum in 2015, stressed the urgent need for the use of project management and proposed in each region of the country to create special headquarters, project offices that will become some kind of development administrations and ensure the introduction of better mechanisms for creating a favorable investment climate.

Development of this direction jointly with government agencies is carried out by the Analytical Center under the Government of the Russian Federation. In order to increase interest in the implementation of project management of the Center, the annual contest «Project Olympus» is held.

According to Noskov K.Yu., head of the Analytical Center under the Government of the Russian Federation, the experience of the «Project Olympus» contest shows that although the project practice is popular, «do not engage in campaigning, making it a fashionable trend», as the project management is only beginning to be introduced

into the work of public authorities, and while it is often more convenient to work in a different logic. (Noskov 2016)

For example, based on the results of the contest in 2014, the Government of the Belgorod region took the first place in the category «Project Management Systems with an aggregate budget of more than 500 million rubles in regional and municipal authorities and subordinate organizations.» In 2015, Belgorod Region won in the nomination «Organization and activities of project offices in the executive bodies of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation». (Chursina 2015: 27)

The experience of the Belgorod Region in creating a project office by the Agency for Strategic Initiatives (Table 1) is listed as an example in the methodological recommendations for the application of project management in addressing the challenges of improving the investment climate in the constituent entities of the Russian Federation.

Table 1 – Example – creation and functioning of the central project office in the Belgorod region *

CENTRAL PROJECT OFFICE
Head of the Department of Organizational and Project Activities of the Department of Internal and Personnel Policy of the Belgorod Region
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Structural subdivision of the Investment and Innovation Department of the Economic Development Department of the Belgorod Region - Management of the project-analytical and control-organizational work of the Department of Internal and Personnel Work of the Belgorod Region
FUNCTIONAL <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Coordination, monitoring, monitoring of the implementation of projects, including investment - Methodological support - Administration of indicators of investment attractiveness
Note * – is compiled on the basis of the source (13)

This process in the region started with the Regulation on Project Management in the Executive Authorities and State Bodies of the Belgorod Region approved by the Decree of the Government of the Belgorod Region dated May 31, 2010. The Regulations provide the concept and definition of project management and the classification of projects into municipal, regional, departmental, interdepartmental and others. The management process includes all phases of project management.

The Office of Project-Analytical and Control-Organizational Work is part of the Department of Internal and Personnel Policy of the Government of the Belgorod Region. For the work on increasing the effectiveness and efficiency of the activities organized on the principle of project management in

the executive bodies and state bodies, the department of design and organizational activities of the Office, which includes a wide range of work in the field of project management, is responsible.

In accordance with the order of the Governor of the Belgorod Region dated 29 April 2011 No. 279-r «On the establishment of industry expert review commissions» to executive bodies and state bodies of the Belgorod region, the opening and closing of projects is carried out only on the basis of their review by industry expert commissions.

When civil servants are included in the project team, knowledge of the basics of the project management and the content of the project is checked, to which they are involved. The function of organizing and conducting testing is outsourced

to the OAU «Institute for Regional Personnel Policy».

The base of all implemented projects, both regional and municipal levels, is contained in the automated information system AIS «Project Management». This system allows to track the development, implementation and completion of each project, record any deviations. (Chursina 2015:27)

Implemented by the Government of the Belgorod Region, the introduction of project management into the civil service system is inherently a project that in the future, perhaps, will be widely used. However, in Russia work remains to be done to consider not only the Belgorod experience, but also the experience of the Perm Krai, the Yaroslavl region and other regions. What will be the system implementation of project management, time will tell. To date, many unresolved issues remain unresolved, such as the absence in the regulatory framework of Russia of generally accepted project management terminology.

Researchers in the implementation of project management in the Belgorod region among the weak points indicate the following aspects: Stimulation of participants in the project activity is still imperfect. It is provided only on the basis of the results of the project; – The project activity is regulated by a large number of documents. This list is constantly growing, and the adopted regulatory and legal acts are periodically amended; – Insufficient attention is paid to a comprehensive evaluation of the effectiveness of projects, including their budgetary effectiveness. –

It is advisable to adopt a single normative legal document that takes into account the accumulated experience and regulates all aspects of project activities in the executive bodies and state bodies of the Belgorod region. It is necessary to develop a clear procedure for selecting projects for financing, taking into account the interests of all project participants, as well as the project environment. (Anichin 2014:14)

Despite the existing problems, the innovation of the executive power of the Belgorod region to create a project office and the introduction of project management in the activities of government bodies as an example can be used in other regions of the Russian Federation.

In the experience of implementing the project office of the regions, duplication of work by employees is possible. That is, continuing to work in the previous system additionally draw up formal project documents. In this area, there is a need for

further study of the performance documents. At the same time, there is a need to conduct research using an anonymous survey among civil servants of a separate agency using the project office in its activity.

A successful project on the use of project management in large state projects in the Russian Federation, according to experts, is the holding of the XXII Olympic Winter Games and the XI Paralympic Winter Games in Sochi in 2014. With the existing difficulties, the project as a whole proved itself on the positive side.

This Russian experience, of course, is important for Kazakhstan in the context of the current implementation of the project of the International Specialized Exhibition EXPO-2017 in the city of Astana. This was written in the article by Kazakhstan researchers A.Tsekhova. and Tutkysbaev K.S. They carried out a comparative analysis of project management of the Olympiad held in Sochi-2014 and EXPO-2017. Based on the results of this analysis, researchers concluded that there are significant risks that may affect the quality of the event. The risks associated with the issues of the deadlines for the preparatory period of the exhibition are specified, and recommendations are given. In particular, the need for:

large-scale application of tools, methods and standards for project management and training of all staff in basic courses of project management; – a clear distribution of the functional responsibilities of the project participants with the appointment of the coordinator; – a complete change in the platform and content of the exhibition site with the ability to access information on the timing of delivery of construction sites, on the targeted use of funds. (Workshop 2014: 158) –

Unfortunately, the principles of the project approach were not effectively used by the previous organizers of the exhibition. The creation of a centralized project office for this event would minimize the risks of misuse of funds.

Consideration of the Russian experience in the process of implementing project management shows that in Kazakhstan at present in central government agencies the study of this issue is only at an initial level. One of the advantages of Kazakhstan when considering the prospects for the introduction of project management into the system of public administration is a unitary system of power. The lack of a federal division of management, allows you to save time when deciding in central departments and implementing pilot projects in the regions.

When implementing the tools of project management, it is necessary to rely on the national standard of ST RK ISO21500-2014, introduced at the beginning of this year – the Project Management Guide. The standard can be used in organizations of any type, including public, private or public, and for any type of project, regardless of complexity, size and duration.

At present, there are prerequisites to the fact that the issues of implementing project management in the sphere of civil service in Kazakhstan in the

near future will be considered at the governmental level. Systemic study of experience in the field of project management, developed in the state sphere of the near and far abroad, will allow us to use the most optimal methods of project management with adaptation to Kazakhstan conditions.

The role of the use of project management tools will continue to grow, as the realities of today's rapidly changing world force states to make quick decisions and effectively implement projects at both the national and international levels.

Литература

1. Абдрасилов Б. Новые подходы к профессионализации государственной службы // Казахстанская правда. – 2015. – 15 июля.
2. Алибекова Р. «Правильные» проекты – управляемые // казахская правда. – 2010. – 10 декабря. <http://www.mining.kz/component/k2/item/12564-pravilnye-proekty-upravlyaemye>
3. Аничин В.Л., Середина О.А. Управление проектами в Белгородской области: теория и практика // Вестник Курской государственной сельскохозяйственной академии. – 2012. – №6. – стр. 14-16.
4. Анненков М.Е. Проблемы управления госкорпорациями. // Современная экономика: проблемы, тенденции, перспективы. – 2010. – №4
5. Эрежев Б.Т. О принципах управления проектами в системе государственного управления. Отчет об аппаратном совещании под председательством председателя АДНПС с 10.11.2015. <http://www.nomad.su/?a=3-201511100025>
6. Иргалиев И.Ж. Офис проекта как центр компетенции для управления изменениями в компаниях // Материалы I Международного конгресса менеджеров проектов в Республике Казахстан. Разработка управления проектами. Практика и перспективы. – Астана, 2015 год. – С.141-153.
7. Эсенгельдина А.С. Управление проектами: проблемы и перспективы развития в РК. // Вестник Национальной академии наук Республики Казахстан. – 2015. Том 4 № 356. – С. (59-64)
8. Исабекова М. Реализация управления проектами в государственном секторе: сопротивление неизбежно? <https://www.zakon.kz/4868695-vnedrenie-proektnogo-upravleniya-v.html>
9. Послание Президента Республики Казахстан Н.Назарбаева народу Казахстана с 14.12.2012 г. «Стратегия Казахстана – 2050» http://www.akorda.kz/en/addresses/addresses_of_president/page
10. Выступление Президента Российской Федерации Владимира В.В. на SPIEF-2015 (упоминание о проектных офисах) <http://pmlead.ru/?p=2373>
11. Козлова А.А. Сильные и слабые стороны реализации управления проектами в государственном управлении. // Лидерство и управление. – 2016. – Том 3. № 1
12. Кораблев М.М. Разработка проектного подхода в государственном управлении. // Научные заметки Казанского государственного университета. – 2010. 152-4
13. Мартин П., Тейт К. Управление проектами. – Санкт-Петербург: Питер. – 2006. – 224 с.
14. Моргунова Н.В. Методические подходы к оценке лучших практик применения методов управления проектами государственными органами. // Российское предпринимательство. – 2013. – № 23 (245)
15. Носков К. На повестке дня – эффективность государственного управления. <http://ac.gov.ru/events/07807.html>
16. Чурсина В.Н. Практика реализации управления проектами в исполнительной ветви субъекта Российской Федерации (на примере Белгородской области) // Государственное и муниципальное управление в XXI веке: теория, методология, практика. – 2015. – № 20. – С.27-34.
17. Цеховой А.Ф., Туткишбаев К.С. Управление проектами как инструмент эффективной реализации крупномасштабных событий // Поиск. Международный научный журнал-приложение Республики Казахстан. – 2014. – № 2 (1). – С.158-163.
18. Якимова Н.М. Возможности и ограничения проектного подхода в контексте реализации нового государственного управления // АРСАДМИНИСТРАНДИ. – 2015. – №1. – С.16-27.
19. Методические рекомендации по применению управления проектами в решении проблем улучшения инвестиционного климата в субъектах Российской Федерации. <http://asi.ru/upload/iblock/5eb>
20. Рекомендации Первого Международного Конгресса Менеджеров Проектов Республики Казахстан. <http://www.spmrk.kz/vse-novosti/item/608-rekomendaczii-pervogo-mezhdunarodnogo-kongressa-proektnyx-menedzherov-napravljen>

References

1. Abdrasilov B. New approaches to the professionalization of public service // Kazakhstan's truth. – 2015. – 15 July.
2. Alibekova R. «Correct» projects – managed // Kazakh truth. – 2010. – 10 December. <http://www.mining.kz/component/k2/item/12564-pravilnye-proekty-upravlyaemye>

- 3 Anichin VL, Seredina OA Project management in the Belgorod region: Theory and practice // Bulletin of the Kursk State Agricultural Academy. – 2012. – №6. – P. 14-16.
- 4 Annenkov ME The problems of governance of state corporations. // Modern Economy: Problems, Trends, Prospects. – 2010. – №4.
- 5 Erezhev B.T. On the principles of implementing project management in the system of public administration. Report on the hardware meeting under the chairmanship of the chairman of the ADHPC from 10.11.2015. [Http://www.nomad.su/?a=3-201511100025](http://www.nomad.su/?a=3-201511100025)
- 6 Irgaliev I.Zh. Project office as a competence center for managing changes in companies // Materials of the I International Congress of Project Managers in the Republic of Kazakhstan. Development of project management. Practice and prospects. – Astana, 2015. – P.141-153.
- 7 Esengeldina A.S. Project management: problems and prospects of development in the RK. // Bulletin of the National Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Kazakhstan. – 2015. Volume 4 No. 356. – S. (59-64)
- 8 Isabekova M. Implementation of project management in the public sector: resistance is inevitable? [Https://www.zakon.kz/4868695-vnedrenie-proektnogo-upravleniya-v.html](https://www.zakon.kz/4868695-vnedrenie-proektnogo-upravleniya-v.html)
- 9 The message of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan N.Nazarbayev to the people of Kazakhstan from 14.12.2012. «Strategy Kazakhstan – 2050» http://www.akorda.kz/en/addresses/addresses_of_president/page
- 10 Speech by the President of the Russian Federation Vladimir V.V. at SPIEF-2015 (mention of project offices) <http://pmllead.ru/?p=2373>
- 11 Kozlova A.A. Strengths and weaknesses of the implementation of project management in public administration. // Leadership and management. – 2016. – Volume 3.- No. 1
- 12 Korablev MM Development of the project approach in public administration. // Scientific notes of Kazan State University. – 2010. 152-4
- 13 Martin P., Tate K. Project management. – St. Petersburg: Peter. – 2006. – 224 p.
- 14 Morgunova N.V. Methodical approaches to assessing the best practices in the application of project management methods by public authorities. // Russian Entrepreneurship. – 2013. – No. 23 (245)
- 15 Noskov K. On the agenda – the effectiveness of public administration. <http://ac.gov.ru/events/07807.html>
- 16 Chursina V.N. The practice of implementing project management in the executive branch of the subject of the Russian Federation (On the example of the Belgorod region) // State and municipal management in the 21st century: Theory, methodology, practice. – 2015. – № 20. – P.27-34.
- 17 Tsekhovoy AF, Tutkyshbaev KS Project management as a tool for effective implementation of large-scale events // Search. International scientific journal-annex of the Republic of Kazakhstan. – 2014. – No. 2 (1). – P.158-163.
- 18 Yakimova NM Opportunities and limitations of the project approach in the context of the implementation of the new public management // ARSADMINISTRANDI. – 2015. – №1. – С.16-27.
- 19 Methodical recommendations on the application of project management in solving problems of improving the investment climate in the subjects of the Russian Federation. <http://asi.ru/upload/iblock/5eb>
- 20 Recommendations of the First International Congress of Project Managers of the Republic of Kazakhstan. <http://www.spmrk.kz/vse-novosti/item/608-rekomendaczii-pervogo-mezhdunarodnogo-kongressa-proektnyx-menedzherov-napravlen>